

Chris Dessonville

HW2 –Heuristic Evaluation of ArtBark

Collaborators: None

Page: “For comments to give feedback”

1. Bad: Post area is a textarea, but text gets collapsed to one line (internal consistency)
 - a. This is bad because it is inconsistent with what gets shown in the output to the user. Some users might try to create elaborate designs without a critique, and this prevents it. (See deviantArt for a better example)
 - b. Potential solutions:
 - i. Support multi-line displays
 - ii. Use a standard input field instead of a textarea
 - iii. A “preview” button which shows you the single line comment
 - c. Related bug: Editing a collapsed item will actually remove spaces
2. Bad: Unable to hit “enter” to save an edit (external consistency)
 - a. The box looks much like a chatbox on Facebook or like any normal form. Thus, it is expected that hitting enter will save the entry I am editing.
 - b. Similarly, it might be expected that hitting escape would cancel the edit.
3. Bad: No way to cancel edit (safety)
 - a. If I want to stop my edit of a comment, I can’t escape and stay on the same page.
4. Bad: No confirmation before deleting a comment (safety)
 - a. There should be at least some form of prevention before deleting

5. Bad: Trying to change current rating only shows more stars, not less (internal consistency)
 - a. Specifically, if I rate 3 stars and then try to change it to 4, it'll show the new stars to add. However, it will NOT show that stars would be removed if I was to try and click 2 or 1
6. Bad: No indication of ability to tag inside the image (learnability)
 - a. There is no way to
7. Bad: Didn't change cursor for stars (consistency)
 - a. The stars are clickable, so they should have a different pointer than the standard
8. Bad: The target makes me think "selection" tool from photoshop (external consistency)
 - a. You are unable to select an area. I know you're going for "target a spot," but many other apps use that to select an area
 - b. Possible solution:
 - i. Switch to an "X" for "x marks the spot"
 - ii. Change the cursor to the actual tagging image, so you know you're going to place one
9. Bad: Adding a tag/hashtag doesn't have a space (readability)
 - a. Makes it hard to read since it just appends to the end.
10. Bad: Adding a tag/hashtag doesn't insert at the cursor (external consistency)
 - a. Most programs will insert wherever the current cursor is pointed when clicking to add a tag.
11. Bad: I'm not able to create my own tags, or at least it seems that way (internal consistency)

- a. There is a list of tags shown. If I attempt to add my own by typing “#chriswashere,” it doesn’t add it as an option to the end. This makes me wonder if it’ll be officially recognized or if I can’t add my own tags.
 - i. I do realize that the author can create the tags, but that seems weird to not let a commenter add their own. After Twitter, people will expect to be able to add their own.

12. Good: The ability to mark with a location is an amazing idea.

- a. It lets me give directed feedback on top of a general comment. Great idea.

Page: “For artists to view feedback”

1. Bad: “Filter by...” seems misleading/confusing (consistency)
 - a. I’m unable to decipher if clicking the button will show me only Mentors or hide Mentors (what it actually does.)
 - b. Possible solutions:
 - i. Try some different verbiage that can’t be easily used in both senses (i.e. “Hide by...”)
 - ii. Use a check box, such that you know it is currently “on” and can be turned off
2. Bad: Highlighting text in a red tag will actually close the tag (efficiency/usability)
 - a. This forces me to copy it from the right (efficiency)

- b. Prevents me from maybe compiling a list of things I need to work on, by quoting items (usability)
- 3. Bad: Hovering over a posted comment doesn't show the tag (efficiency)
 - a. I have to go one by one across all the red tags on the image to find out which one matches a comment
 - b. Suggested solution: When hovering over a red comment, show the corresponding box on the left. It's easy to hide it again on mouseout.
 - i. With this, it's worth considering a way to continue to show the red tag (i.e. click on the comment to keep there)
- 4. Bad: Image still has the target placement cursor (consistency)
 - a. This would infer that I can still click to add a tag.
- 5. Bad: Showing tags when there are no items with that tag (consistency)
 - a. This infers to me that something with that tag must exist, but doesn't.
- 6. Bad: There's no immediate cue that the red comments correspond to an image tag (learnability)
 - a. It would help if when you hovered over them, it made the tag on the image visible.
- 7. Good: This is highly consistent with the post feedback page!
 - a. This means a user knows exactly where everything is, right away.
- 8. Curious: Are you going to have pagination? What happens with 1,000 comments?
 - a. Keep in mind that it's difficult to read a comment and see the part of the image it corresponds to

9. Curious: What do you think about newest comments first, so you don't have to scroll all the way down/go to the last page?
10. Curious: How does this handle with a LARGE image? Remember, many art pictures are going to be very high resolution. (My suggestion is a deviantArt like zoom on click.)
11. Curious: You seem to have a profile link for me... will the names of "Your mentor" and others be links to their profile, so I can exchange feedback?

Page: "Artists Setup"

1. Bad: The margin above the hero-unit is different from the other two pages (consistency)
2. Bad: What does the cancel button do? If I select an image in any way, it continues to the next page. Doesn't seem useful...
3. Bad: Typo on the first page. "Upload buttons" There's only one "Upload" button
4. Bad: I can finish the privacy settings page without assigning everyone (safety)
 - a. There is no sign on what behavior is expected then
5. Bad: The description text for privacy settings is a similar grey to the background. This is hard to read (usability)
6. Bad: There's both a "next page" button and a "submit" button (learnability)
 - a. Infers a different usage
7. Bad: The auto-complete takes precedence (usability)

- a. If I want to have a tag that's a substring of a longer item, it breaks. (i.e. "ign" is a substring of "Design", but it pre-selects design, so hitting enter inserts design instead of ign.)
 - b. Suggested solution: Show the auto-complete, but prevent it from pre-selecting the first item. Let them use arrow keys/mouse to do that
8. Bad: the template for the "add tag" page seems broken... even, unfinished?
9. Bad: The black font on the teal background for once you add a tag (add tag page), makes it hard to read (usability)
10. Bad: You can enter a blank string as a tag (safety)
11. Bad: There's no warning/notification when you attempt to double add a tag (learnability)
 - a. It's simple enough to have a message popup underneath the add form and then fade out
12. Bad: The next page will error out if your tags have space in them (safety)
13. Good: I absolutely love that you implemented drag & drop upload.
14. Good: The drag and drop for privacy settings is great. Love the use of a different mouse icon.
15. Good: The auto-complete is very useful to find other commonly used tags
16. Good: You can't double add tags on the add tag page
17. Curious: For drag/drop privacy, would it maybe be better to let them move left-right into groups instead of pre-positioning them above it all?

Overall:

1. Bad: There's no way to toggle off the current tags (usability)
 - a. This prevents me from enjoying the piece. If it has been heavily commented by other users, it's hard for me to thoroughly see it when I go to critique.
 - b. Suggest solution: A simple toggle to show/hide the tags
2. Good: The design is simple, clean, and professional. This is a great way to keep users coming back.

My notes: Please don't think my critique harsh since I had more "bad" points than "good" points. If something is really good, I pointed it out. If it's normal-good, I just let it be.